

# Human Rights Law Journal · HRLJ

HRLJ

30 September 2022

Vol. 42 (2022) No. 1-9

ISSN 0174/4704

Pages 1-340

## 1. ARTICLES

**Angelika Nußberger**, Cologne

The Future of European Human Rights Protection – On the Question of the *status quo* in Twenty Years' Time..... 1

**Robert Spano**, Strasbourg

The European Court of Human Rights in 2040 – Lost Utopia or Trademark of the 21<sup>st</sup> Century ? ..... 5

**Koen Lenaerts**, Luxembourg

The European Court of Justice in 2040 – Pacemaker of European Integration or Lost in Transition ?..... 9

**Jonathan Mance**, London

Britain on Its Own – The Way Forward to Tradition ? ..... 15

**Mary Arden**, London / **Adam Bodnar**, Warsaw /

**Lado Chanturia**, Strasbourg / **Angelika Nußberger**, Cologne / **Ganna Yudkivska**, Kyiv  
Human Rights for the Future – A Chance for Peace ?..... 18

**Theodor Shulman**, Munich

“Not Deeply Rooted” ? A Commentary on the Supreme Court’s Decision to Eliminate the Federal Constitutional Right to Abortion..... 27

## 2. DECISIONS and REPORTS

**UN Human Rights Committee (UN-HRCee), Geneva**

– 21.VII.22 – Impact of adverse climate change on low-lying islands / Violation of the State’s positive obligation to protect the authors’ rights under the Covenant (Article 17 – home, private life and family; Article 27 – enjoyment of minority culture) / *Billy et al. v. Australia*..... 34

**International Court of Justice (ICJ), The Hague**

– 16.III.22 – Russian military operations since 24 February 2022 in the territory of Ukraine / Application of the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide / Provisional measures ordered / *Ukraine v. Russian Federation* ..... 46

**European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), Strasbourg**

– 15.III.22 – Judicial reforms in Poland weakening judicial independence: Issue examined for the first time by the Grand Chamber / Premature ending of mandate for a member of the Polish National Council of the Judiciary violates Article 6 ECHR (right to access to a court) / *Grzęda v. Poland (GC)*..... 63

– 5.IV.22 – Novel questions regarding freedom and pluralism of broadcasting / Licence revocation of a private television channel / No violation of freedom of expression (Article 10 ECHR) and the right to property (Article 1 Protocol No. 1) / *NIT S.R.L. v. Moldova (GC)* ..... 123

– 11.VII.22 – Failure to fulfil the *Kavala* judgment of 10 December 2019 which called on the Government to end the applicant’s detention and secure his immediate release / Infringement proceedings under the terms of Article 46 § 4 ECHR / *Kavala v. Türkiye (GC)* ..... 157

– 14.IX.22 – Request for repatriation of French nationals held in camps in Syria: Application partly inadmissible due to lack of France’s jurisdiction (Article 1 ECHR) regarding complaint of ill-treatment / Applicants cannot claim a *general right* to repatriation based on Article 3 § 2 of Protocol No. 4 (right to enter national territory), but they must be afforded a decision-making process by appropriate safeguards against arbitrariness / *H.F. et al. v. France (GC)* ..... 183

– 8.IV.22 – *Advisory Opinion requested by the Lithuanian Supreme Administrative Court*: Criteria to be applied in the assessment of whether the ban preventing a former Member of Parliament (Ms. N.V.), removed in impeachment proceedings from standing for election to the *Seimas* has become disproportionate with the consequence that it breaches Article 3 of Protocol No. 1 (the right to free elections)..... 221

(Contents continued on the next page)



N. P. Engel, Publisher

www.hrlj.info

e-mail: N.P.Engel@HRLJ.info

# Human Rights Law Journal

HRLJ · and continuation of The Human Rights Review

## Editorial Advisory Board:

Thomas Buergenthal, Washington, D.C. · Antônio Cançado Trindade†, The Hague · Tim Eicke, Strasbourg ·  
Jochen Abr. Frowein, Heidelberg · Anatoly Kovler, Moscow · Paul Mahoney, Strasbourg ·  
Jörg Paul Müller, Bern · Willibald P. Pahr, Vienna · Guido Raimondi, Rome · Sonia Picado Sotela,  
San José (Costa Rica) · The Right Hon. Lord Mance, London · William A. Schabas, London ·  
Christian Tomuschat, Berlin

Editor-in-Chief: Erika Engel

Associate Editor: John Packer, Ottawa

## Table of Contents Vol. 42 (2022) No. 1-9 (continued)

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <b>European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), Strasbourg</b>  |     |
| – 26.IV.22 – <i>Advisory Opinion requested by the Armenian Court of Cassation</i> : The national court asks for guidance in the context of the execution of the ECtHR judgment in <i>Virabyan v. Armenia</i> of 2012 leading to a criminal case on torture declared time-barred / Scope and nature of Article 3 (prohibition of torture) and Article 7 (no punishment without law).....                                  | 234 |
| – 13.VII.22 – <i>Advisory Opinion requested by the French Conseil d'État</i> / The question concerned the difference in treatment of the landowners' associations set up before and after the creation of an approved municipal hunters' association / Application of Article 14 (prohibition of discrimination) taken together with Article 1 of Protocol No. 1 (protection of property).....                           | 248 |
| <b>Court of Justice of the European Union (CJEU), Luxembourg</b>   |     |
| – 22.II.22. – Principle of the primacy of EU law / Effect of decisions of a constitutional court / Independence of the judiciary requires that a national judge (here: in Romania) may not incur disciplinary liability on the ground that he applied EU law – as interpreted by the CJEU – but thereby departing from the case-law of its own Constitutional Court / <i>Case of RS</i> .....                            | 261 |
| – 5.IV.22 – Stringent criteria to be applied regarding the limited admissibility of the general and indiscriminate retention of traffic and location data relating to electronic communications (here: in Ireland) / <i>Commissioner of An Garda Síochána et al.</i> ....  | 268 |
| – 20.IX.22 – EU law precludes national legislation which provides – on a preventive basis – for the general and indiscriminate retention of traffic and location data (here: in Germany) / Confirmation of previous case-law ( <i>see above at p. 268</i> ) / <i>SpaceNet and Telekom Deutschland</i> .....  | 283 |
| – 7.IX.22 – Defence and promotion of the official language of a Member State (here: in Latvia) / Organisation of the education system / <i>Cilevičs et al.</i> .....   | 298 |
| <b>UK Supreme Court, London</b>  |     |
| – 6.VII.22 – Functions of diplomatic missions in general protected by immunity / Trafficking and exploitation of a domestic worker (a national of the Philippines) in the household of a diplomat (representing Saudi Arabia in the UK) not covered by immunity if the alleged form of modern slavery is proved / Judgment rendered by a majority of three to two / <i>Basfar (Respondent) v. Wong (Appellant)</i> ..... | 304 |
| <b>German Federal Constitutional Court, Karlsruhe</b>  |     |
| – 27.IV.22 – Unsuccessful constitutional complaint challenging the obligation for staff in the health and care sectors to provide proof of vaccination against COVID-19 .....  | 325 |
| <b>3. DOCUMENTATION</b>  |     |
| <b>Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe, Strasbourg</b>   |     |
| – 16.III.22 – Cessation of the membership of the Russian Federation to the Council of Europe as from 16 March 2022 .....   | 339 |
| <b>European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), Strasbourg</b>  |     |
| – 22.III.22 – Consequences of the cessation of Russia's membership to the Council of Europe.....   | 339 |
| – 5.IX.22 – Office of a judge with respect to the Russian Federation ceases to exist on 16 September 2022  | 339 |
| <b>4. PENDING PROCEEDINGS</b>  |     |
| <b>European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), Strasbourg</b>  |     |
| – 14.VI.22 – Urgent interim measure granted in case concerning asylum-seeker's imminent removal from the UK to Rwanda / <i>N.S.K. v. United Kingdom</i> .....  | 340 |



N. P. Engel, Publisher

www.hrlj.info

e-mail: N.P.Engel@HRLJ.info