

Human Rights Law Journal · HRLJ

HRLJ

29 September 2023

Vol. 43 (2023) No. 1-9

ISSN 0174/4704

Pages 1-336

Obituary

for **Thomas Buergenthal** (11 May 1934 – 29 May 2023)

by Christian Tomuschat, Berlin 1

1. ARTICLES

Síofra O’Leary, Strasbourg

The Rule of Law and Constitutional Diversity: Perspectives from the European Court of Human Rights 4

Lucius Calfisch, Geneva

The Jurisdiction *ratione temporis* of the ECtHR Considering the Effects of the Russian Aggression against Ukraine on the Human Rights Level: The Court’s Decision in *Pivkina v. Russia* (6 June 2023) 9

Susanne Baer, Berlin

Freedom of Expression and Democracy 15

2. DECISIONS and REPORTS

UN Human Rights Committee (UN-HRCee), Geneva

– 13.VII.21 – Arbitrary criminal proceedings against the investigating judge and removal from office in cases of major political significance (*Franco regime* and *Gürtel cases*) / New jurisprudence established / *Baltasar Garzón v. Spain* 22

– 26.VII.22 – Right to review of a life sentence by way of Presidential pardon / National procedure lacks clarity and predictability / Violation of Article 7 of the Covenant (inhuman treatment) / *Aliev v. Ukraine* 30

– 19.VII.22 – Disproportionate impact of conditions of detention on an author with multiple disabilities / Violation of the Covenant regarding the duty to protect the right to life (Article 6 para. 1) / Specific circumstances represent inhuman treatment contrary to Articles 7 and 10 / *Dafnis v. Greece* 38

– 25.X.22 – Deprivation of liberty for seven months in excess of the time determined by the judiciary / Various claims for compensation failed / Violation of Article 9 para. 5 of the Covenant (compensation for unlawful detention) / Arbitrary delay in the sentence aggregation proceedings / *Barrio v. Spain* 47

– 26.X.22 – Penalty proceedings against a national newspaper (*El Universo*) for news published / Communication submitted by directors and shareholders of the newspaper / Freedom of expression and the right to an effective remedy violated / *Barriga v. Ecuador* 54

European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), Strasbourg

– 2.II.23 – Border control operation in 2016 (a period of massive influx of migrants) at a river on the Hungarian-Serbian border / Death of the applicant’s brother / State’s procedural and substantive obligations regarding the right to life and the prohibition of ill-treatment (Articles 2 and 3 ECHR) / *Alhowais v. Hungary* 63

– 4.VII.23 – “Right to be forgotten” in the light of online access allowed since 2008 of a newspaper article published in 1994 / The Grand Chamber confirms the obligation of the applicant (Patrick Hurbain, publisher of the daily newspaper *Le Soir*) to anonymise the online archived version of the article / *Hurbain v. Belgium (GC)* 76

– 15.V.23 – Conviction of a politician for not promptly deleting unlawful comments on Facebook did not breach his right to freedom of expression (Article 10 ECHR) / *Sanchez v. France (GC)* 114

– 23.I.23 – Children’s book of fairy tales depicting same-sex relationships as essentially equivalent to different-sex relationships / Obligation to mark the book with warning labels “harmful to children under the age of 14” violates freedom of expression (Article 10 ECHR) / *Macatè v. Lithuania (GC)* 146

(Contents continued on the next page)



N. P. Engel, Publisher

www.hrlj.info

e-mail: N.P.Engel@HRLJ.info

Human Rights Law Journal

HRLJ · and continuation of The Human Rights Review

Editorial Advisory Board:

Thomas Buergenthal†, Washington, D.C. · Tim Eicke, Strasbourg · Jochen Abr. Frowein, Heidelberg · Anatoly Kovler, Moscow · Paul Mahoney, Strasbourg · Jörg Paul Müller, Bern · Willibald P. Pahr, Vienna · Guido Raimondi, Rome · Sonia Picado Sotela, San José (Costa Rica) · The Right Hon. Lord Mance, London · William A. Schabas, London · Christian Tomuschat, Berlin

Editor-in-Chief: Erika Engel

Associate Editor: John Packer, Ottawa

Table of Contents Vol. 43 (2023) No. 1-9 (continued)

European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), Strasbourg	
- 1.VI.23 – Grand Chamber clarifies the limits of the Court’s power to recharacterise an applicant’s complaints / The Chamber judgment exceeded <i>proprio motu</i> the powers conferred on the Court by Articles 32 and 34 ECHR / <i>Grosam v. Czech Republic (GC)</i>	177
- 14.III.23 – Failure of the Court of Cassation to give any reasons for its refusal to ask the CJEU for a preliminary ruling / Violation of the right to a fair hearing (Article 6 § 1 ECHR) / <i>Georgiou v. Greece</i>	191
- 12.I.23 – Disciplinary liability of judges / Dismissal (in 2014) of two Constitutional Court Judges by Parliament for their judicial opinion expressed in a judgment of 2010, qualified as “breach of oath”/ Violation of the right to respect for private life (Article 8 ECHR) and the fair trial guarantee (Article 6 § 1 ECHR) / <i>Ovcharenko and Kolos v. Ukraine</i>	196
- 17.I.23 – Legal situation of same-sex couples in Russia: Total absence of a specific legal framework to allow legal recognition and protection for same-sex couples violates the right to respect for private and family life (Article 8 ECHR) / <i>Fedotova et al. v. Russia (GC)</i>	213
- 1.VI.23 – Legal situation of same-sex couples in Ukraine / Discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation (Article 14 in conjunction with Article 8) / <i>Maymulakhin and Markiv v. Ukraine</i>	242
- 23.V.23 – Legal situation of same-sex couples in Romania / Existing law provides for only one form of family union, i.e. an opposite-sex marriage / Violation of the right to respect for private and family life (Article 8 ECHR) / <i>Buhuceanu et al. v. Romania</i>	251
- 13.IV.23 – <i>Advisory Opinion rendered at the request of the Supreme Court of Finland</i> : The question concerned a case of an adult adoption / The Grand Chamber observes that the private life aspect (Article 8 ECHR) does not require that a biological parent be granted the status of a party in the national adoption procedure	261
General Court of the European Union (GCEU), Luxembourg	
- 27.VII.22 – Confirmation of a temporary broadcasting ban regarding <i>RT France</i> , a private television service controlled and financed by the Kremlin / <i>Case of RT France</i>	268
UK Supreme Court, London	
- 21.VI.23 – Structure of the obligations imposed by Article 2 ECHR (right to life) / Procedural positive obligations regarding the investigation into the death of a patient who lived in a care home for adults requiring round-the-clock supervision / <i>Case of “Jackie” (Ms Jacqueline Maguire)</i>	288
3. DOCUMENTATION	
- 17.V.23 – Fourth Summit of Heads of State and Government of the Council of Europe Reykjavík Declaration – United around our values	315
- 27.X.22 – Advisory Panel of Experts on Candidates for election as Judge to the ECtHR Fifth activity report: May 2019 to July 2022	323
4. PENDING PROCEEDINGS	
- 19.XII.22 – Court of Justice of the European Union (CJEU), Luxembourg Infringement proceedings: Hungarian law of 2021 adopting stricter measures regarding the promotion or portrayal of gender identities that do not correspond to the sex assigned at birth, sex reassignment or homosexuality / <i>Commission v. Hungary</i>	335

