

Human Rights Law Journal · HRLJ

HRLJ

31 July 2024

Vol. 44 No. 1-7

ISSN 0174/4704

Pages 1-284

1. ARTICLES **Christian Tomuschat, Berlin**

- Climate Change – An Essay on Global Governance / The Normative World Order in the Light of New Challenges: From 1945 to the 21st Century 1

2. DECISIONS and REPORTS

UN Human Rights Committee (UN-HRCee), Geneva

- 15.III.23 – State’s responsibility regarding public care homes / Tragic death of a person with intellectual disabilities / Violation of Articles 6, 7 and 10 § 1 of the Covenant (right to life, inhuman treatment, deprivation of liberty) / *Lazarova v. Bulgaria* 42
- 21.III.23 – Interpretation of Article 12 § 4 of the Covenant: “right to enter his own country” / Concept of an individual’s own country not limited to nationality in a formal sense: long-standing residence, close personal and family ties must be taken into consideration / Arbitrary removal of a national of North Macedonia (with a significant criminal history), living since the age of 3 for more than 50 years in Australia / Dissenting Opinion of six Committee Members / *S v. Australia* 51
- 13.X.23 – Unlawful restrictions on freedom of expression (Article 19 of the Covenant): Civil courts order to remove an article from an Internet news portal criticizing the then Head of State and oblige the journalist to pay EUR 38,000 for non-pecuniary damages / *Maslova v. Kyrgyzstan* 57
- 31.X.23 – Presidential election campaign in Belarus in 2020 / Viktor Babaryka, the main challenger to the President in office (Alexander Lukashenko) arrested on the basis of unproven accusations by the Department of Financial Investigations the day before the registration of candidates started / Deprivation of liberty without being brought promptly before a judge / Violation of Article 9 §§ 1, 3 and 4 of the Covenant / *Babaryka v. Belarus* 61

European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), Strasbourg

- 13.VI.24 – No right to physician-assisted death (PAD) for a Hungarian with motor neurone disease / Criminal ban on assisted suicide, including its application to any person assisting the applicant to have recourse to PAD abroad / Respondent State’s margin of appreciation not overstepped / Article 8 (private life) and Article 14 (prohibition of discrimination) in conjunction with Article 8 ECHR not violated / Two Separate Opinions / *Dániel Karsai v. Hungary* 67
- 9.IV.24 – Application of six young Portuguese on the issue of climate change directed against various States declared inadmissible / Grand Chamber accepts withdrawal of the application v. Ukraine (due to the ongoing war) / No grounds to extend, by way of interpretation, extraterritorial jurisdiction to States other than Portugal / As far as Portugal is concerned, inadmissibility based on failure to exhaust domestic remedies / *Duarte Agostinho et al. v. Portugal and 32 others (GC)* 97
- 09.IV.24 – Painful legacy of the 2008 Georgia-Russia conflict / Since 2009 process of “borderisation”, blocking people from crossing the administrative boundary lines freely between Georgian-controlled territory and the Russian-backed breakaway Georgia regions of Abkhazia and South Ossetia / Existence of an “administrative practice” / Russia held responsible for multiple violations of ECHR rights / *Georgia v. Russia (IV)* 128
- 23.XI.23 – Violation of the right to an independent and impartial tribunal established by law and the principle of legal certainty (Article 6 § 1 ECHR) / Final judgment in favour of the applicant overturned nine years later by the Chamber of Extraordinary Review and Public Affairs (“CERPA”) of the Supreme Court following an extraordinary appeal by the Prosecutor General, himself an active politician and at the same time the Minister of Justice / Abuse of the extraordinary appeal procedure to further the State’s own political opinions / Pilot-judgment procedure applied to put an end to the systemic violations of Article 6 § 1 / *Wałęsa v. Poland* .. 141
- 07.V.24 – Violence among pupils which occurred during a break between classes (use of a catapult, the applicant’s son lost 90% of vision in one eye) / Violation of Article 8 ECHR (respect for private life) / School authorities’ responsibility to ensure school discipline at all times / Violation of the right of access to a court (Article 6 § 1 ECHR): Time-limit must be calculated from the date when a decision is served on the applicant (not when it had been given by the court) / *Biba v. Albania*.. 185

(Contents continued on the next page)



N. P. Engel, Publisher

www.hrlj.info

e-mail: N.P.Engel@HRLJ.info

Human Rights Law Journal

HRLJ · and continuation of The Human Rights Review

Editorial Advisory Board:

Thomas Buergenthal†, Washington, D.C. · Tim Eicke, Strasbourg · Jochen Abr. Frowein, Heidelberg · Anatoly Kovler, Moscow · Paul Mahoney, Strasbourg · Jörg Paul Müller, Bern · Willibald P. Pahr, Vienna · Guido Raimondi, Rome · Sonia Picado Sotela, San José (Costa Rica) · The Right Hon. Lord Mance, London · William A. Schabas, London · Christian Tomuschat, Berlin

Editor-in-Chief: Erika Engel

Associate Editor: John Packer, Ottawa

Table of Contents Vol. 44 (2024) No. 1-7 (continued)

European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), Strasbourg	
– 28.VI.24 – Request for an Advisory Opinion / High Court of Cassation and Justice of Romania asks two questions concerning the interpretation of Article 6 (right to a fair hearing) and Article 1 of Protocol No. 1 (protection of property) in the context of an audit of the National Integrity Agency regarding a civil servant being unable to prove the source of a total amount of EUR 364,000 with the result that the money has been confiscated / A Panel of the Grand Chamber decides not to accept the request since it did not concern a question of principle (as required under Article 1 § 1 of Protocol No. 16)	196
Court of Justice of the European Union (CJEU), Luxembourg	
– 11.VI.24 – Criteria for granting refugee status for belonging to a “particular social group” / Actual identification with the fundamental value of equality between women and men / Young Iraqi women who already live in the Netherlands for more than 15 years and describe themselves as “westernized” / C-646/21	200
– 16.I.24 – Women as victims of domestic violence / Granting of refugee status / here: in Bulgaria / Entitlement to subsidiary protection for women who are at risk of being killed or suffering other acts of violence due to alleged violation of cultural, religious or traditional norms / C-621/21 ...	208
– 13.VI.24 – Refugee status is generally to be granted to stateless persons of Palestinian origin if the protection or assistance of UNRWA (United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East), with which they are registered, is no longer considered to be granted / C-563/22 ..	216
– 30.IV.24 – Change in case-law (Full Court of the CJEU): General and indiscriminate data retention of IP addresses no longer necessarily a serious interference with fundamental rights / Avoidance of systemic impunity for online criminal offences involving copyright infringement / Identification of suspects permissible / Precise conclusions about their private lives inadmissible / <i>La Quadrature du Net et al. (No. 2)</i>	225
– 25.VI.24 – Interpretation of the Industrial Emissions Directive: Unlawfulness of the repeated extension of an operating permit despite significant risks to the environment and human health having been identified / Suspension of the operating permit required / here: Ilva steel plant / C-626/22	243
– 13.VI.24 – Hungary ordered to pay EUR 200 million and a penalty payment of EUR 1 million for each day of delay for failure to fully implement the Commission/Hungary judgment of December 17, 2020 on the common asylum policy / <i>Commission/Hungary</i>	254
– 11.VII.24 – Ban on wolf hunting in Austria confirmed under EU law (Habitats Directive) / Conditions for an exemption not met / Decision by the Tyrolean government to kill a wolf unlawful / <i>Umweltverband WWF Österreich et al.</i>	265
3. DOCUMENTATION	
European Parliament (EP), Strasbourg	
– 08.II.24 – Allegations of Russian interference in the democratic processes of the European Union	272
European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), Strasbourg	
– 28.III.24 – Practice Direction regarding requests for interim measures revised / Rules of Court, Article 39	276
– 10.IV.24 – President Siofra O’Leary: Exchange of views with the Committee of Ministers	279
European Committee for the Prevention of Torture (CPT), Strasbourg	
– 03.VII.24 – Public Statement concerning Azerbaijan	282
4. PENDING PROCEEDINGS	
European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), Strasbourg	
– 16.IV.24 – Three groups of cases v. Lithuania, Poland and Latvia pending before the Grand Chamber	
– 25.VI.24 – regarding “pushbacks” / Situation at the Belarusian borders from spring 2021 to summer 2023	
– 02.VII.24 – (altogether 62 applicants)	284

