

Human Rights Law Journal · HRLJ

HRLJ

31 December 2024

Vol. 44 No. 8-12

ISSN 0174/4704

Pages 285-480

Editorial: *In memoriam* Norbert Paul Engel 285

1. ARTICLES

XIXth Congress of the Conference of European Constitutional Courts
held in Chişinău, Moldova, from 22 May to 24 May 2024

Plenary Session I

The Interaction between Constitutional Courts and Supranational Courts

- **Síofra O’Leary**, Strasbourg, Opening Address..... 286
- **Christoph Grabenwarter**, Vienna, A European Perspective from Austria..... 288
- **Stephan Harbarth**, Karlsruhe, A European Perspective from Germany..... 290
- **Pierre Nihoul**, Brussels, A European Perspective from Belgium..... 292
- **Egils Levits**, Riga, Concluding Remarks..... 294

* * *

Stephan Weber, Vienna

On the Concept of a ‘National Group’ under the Genocide Convention 296

2. DECISIONS and REPORTS

UN Human Rights Committee (UN-HRCee), Geneva

- 27.III.24 – Annexation of Crimea in 2014 / Imposition of Russian citizenship to prisoners of Ukrainian nationality / Various violations of Covenant rights including Article 26 (equality) in light of the Fourth Geneva Convention / *Roman Bratsylo, Valery Golovko and Sergey Konyukhov v. Russia*..... 306
- 30.X.24 – Forced pregnancy and motherhood: Illiterate child victim of sexual violence since the age of 6, motherhood at the age of 14 (abuse by her grandfather) / Lack of access to abortion / Right to life, prohibition of torture, right to privacy violated / *Susana v. Nicaragua*..... 315
- 31.X.24 – Outsourcing of asylum processing to another State (agreement with Nauru of 2012) / Australia responsible for prolonged and arbitrary detention of asylum seekers intercepted at sea between mid-2013 and early 2014 (24 unaccompanied minors) / *M.I. et al. v. Australia*..... 324
- European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), Strasbourg**
- 19.XI.24 – State’s positive obligation to prevent and stop violence against women / Failure to conduct effective investigation into credible allegations of domestic violence and into circumstances leading to death / Violation of Articles 2, 3 and 14 ECHR / *Vieru v. Moldova* 333
- 17.IX.24 – Shortcomings which led to blood transfusion to a Jehovah’s Witness despite being fully conscious, and against her will (recorded as advance directive deposited in the regional registers) violated her right to private life and of freedom of religion / *Pindo Mulla v. Spain* (GC)..... 347
- 5.XI.24 – Medical treatment in the form of a blood transfusion administered to an unconscious Jehovah’s Witness no violation of Article 8 (right to private life) / *Lindholm and the Estate after Leif Lindholm v. Denmark* 377
- 17.XII.24 – Dispute concerning the consequences of a particular sort of a selective strike / Wages withheld for two days / Wide margin of appreciation to be afforded to domestic authorities / No violation of Article 11 ECHR / *Hellgren v. Finland* 391
- 20.XII.24 – Dismissal of a judge, questions under Article 8 ECHR: A well-developed case-law of the ECtHR is already available / In light of this fact a Panel of the Grand Chamber does not accept the request for an Advisory Opinion from the High Court of Cassation and Justice of Romania 399

(Contents continued on the next page)



N. P. Engel, Publisher

www.hrlj.info

e-mail: N.P.Engel@HRLJ.info

Human Rights Law Journal

HRLJ · and continuation of The Human Rights Review

Editorial Advisory Board:

Thomas Buergenthal†, Washington, D.C. · Tim Eicke, Strasbourg · Jochen Abr. Frowein, Heidelberg · Anatoly Kovler, Moscow · Paul Mahoney, Strasbourg · Jörg Paul Müller, Bern · Willibald P. Pahr, Vienna · Guido Raimondi, Rome · Sonia Picado Sotela, San José (Costa Rica) · The Right Hon. Lord Mance, London · William A. Schabas, London · Christian Tomuschat, Berlin

Editor-in-Chief: Erika Engel

Associate Editor: John Packer, Ottawa

Table of Contents Vol. 44 (2024) No. 8-12 (continued)

Court of Justice of the European Union (CJEU), Luxembourg	
– 10.IX.24 –	Grand Chamber clarifies the scope of the jurisdiction of the EU Courts in matters of the common foreign and security policy (CFSP) / here: Jurisdiction affirmed regarding specific decisions taken by Eurolex Kosovo not part of the CFSP / <i>Case of KS and KD</i> 403
– 04.X.24 –	Situation of women under the new Taliban regime justifies <i>per se</i> being granted refugee status / Discriminatory measures, taken as a whole, can be classified as acts of persecution / <i>Afghan women case</i> 418
– 04.X.24 –	Refusal of a Member State (Romania) to recognise a change of gender identity lawfully acquired in another Member State (UK) hinders the right of free movement and residence / Issue of a new birth certificate may not be linked to new proceedings / <i>Mirin</i> (GC)..... 424
– 04.X.24 –	Protection of freedom of the press as enshrined in Article 11 of the Charter / Proportionality of damages awarded / Criteria for refusing to enforce a judgment in France, rendered in Spain, which manifestly breaches French public policy / <i>Real Madrid Club de Fútbol</i> (GC) 430
– 18.I.24 –	Access to information lawfully restricted regarding the disaster involving flight MH17 (from Amsterdam, Malaysia Airlines, 2014) / Confidentiality of certain information concerning aviation safety is justified and proportionate / <i>RTL Nederland and RTL Nieuws</i> 436
UK Supreme Court, London	
– 17.IV.24 –	Section 146 of the Trade Union and Labour Relations (Consolidation) Act 1992 (“TULRCA”) incompatible with Article 11 ECHR due to insufficient protection against sanctions foreseen against trade union members who participate in lawful strike action / <i>Mercer case</i> 446
German Federal Constitutional Court, Karlsruhe	
– 08.X.24 –	Fight against international cyberthreats / Strategic surveillance of international telecommunications in principle compatible with the Basic Law / Competence of the Federal Intelligence Service / Scope of protection against interference with fundamental rights 461
3. DOCUMENTATION	
Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe (CM), Strasbourg	
– 19.IX.24 –	Supervision of the execution of judgments of the ECtHR / Cases concerning reforms undermining the independence of the judiciary in Poland..... 477
European Committee for the Prevention of Torture (CPT), Strasbourg	
– 18.XI.24 –	Public statement regarding the Russian Federation 478
4. PENDING PROCEEDINGS	
European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), Strasbourg	
– 20.XI.24 –	“Rule-of-law” cases v. Poland adjourned for an additional year until 23 November 2025..... 479
– 25.XI.24 –	Conviction for terrorism offences based on the use of “ByLock” (encrypted messaging application) / Fourth batch of 1,000 applications communicated to the Turkish Government 480

